

Transport and Environment Committee

10.00am, Tuesday, 18 March 2014

Subsidised Bus Service Contract: Ratho Village Service

Item number	7.5
Report number	
Wards	All

Links

Coalition pledges	P19 , P47
Council outcomes	CO9 , CO10 , CO22
Single Outcome Agreement	SO1 , SO2

Mark Turley

Director of Services for Communities

Contact: Ewan Horne, Senior Professional Officer

E-mail: ewan.horne@edinburgh.gov.uk | Tel: 0131 469 3658

Executive summary

Subsidised Bus Service Contract: Ratho Village Service

Summary

Options for a new subsidised bus service contract to serve Ratho Village are described and the cost implications discussed. A recommendation for the award of contract is made on the basis of available funding.

Reference is made to ongoing efforts to provide a public transport link to the Southside for residents of Dumbiedykes.

Recommendations

It is recommended that the Committee:

- 1 notes the intention to accept Lothian Buses Option 1 Alternative Tender at a cost of £5,100 per week (£265,200 *per annum*) to take effect from the commencement of Tram operations for a period of up to four years;
- 2 notes that alternative solutions for a public transport link for Dumbiedykes are still being explored by officials, and that should these negotiations be successful any solution will, after consultation with the Convener, be progressed by the Director of Services for Communities using delegated powers conferred by the Council's Contract Standing Orders.

Measures of success

Despite the uneconomic nature of the service for Ratho Village, it is valued by many sections of the community, particularly the elderly and those on low incomes, who would be otherwise disadvantaged by the lack of a public transport link to the wider network.

Financial impact

Acceptance of Lothian Buses Option 1 Alternative Tender will cost the Council £265,200 *per annum*, an increase of 36% over the present contract the current annual cost of which is £189,478. The shortfall of £75,722 will be met from the additional £120,000 of funding secured for the Subsidised Bus Services budget in financial year 2014/2015.

Equalities impact

Continued provision or enhancement of existing subsidised bus services, and the provision of new ones, enhance the quality of life of users through the enhancement of access to employment, educational, leisure and shopping opportunities.

Sustainability impact

The reduction in dependence on transport by private car made possible by the provision of subsidised bus services contributes to the Council's sustainability aims.

Consultation and engagement

Consultation over the provision of a new public transport link for Ratho Village took place with Ratho Community Council representatives, and the standard options listed below reflect the Community Council's views and aspirations.

Background reading/external references

None.

Subsidised Bus Service Contracts

1. Background

- 1.1 The report describes the process and results of the tendering process for a Subsidised Bus Service for Ratho Village.
- 1.2 The report also notes ongoing efforts to establish a public transport link between Dumbiedykes and the Southside of the city centre.
- 1.3 Recommendations are made on the award of contract for the Ratho Village bus service.

2. Main report

- 2.1 The Council's new Framework Agreement for the Supply of Local Bus Services was approved by the Finance and Budget Committee on 29 August 2013, and implemented on 12 November 2013.
- 2.2 Under this Framework, four standard options for the Ratho service were put out to tender through the Mini Competition mechanism. Tenderers were also given the opportunity to submit Alternative Tenders which might be advantageous to the Council financially or in other ways.
- 2.3 Three participants in the Framework submitted tenders, E&M Horsburgh, First Scotland East Ltd and Lothian Buses plc.
- 2.4 In total, 14 tenders were received, of which 10 were Standard Tenders and four were Alternative Tenders.
- 2.5 A brief description of the Standard Tender specifications appears below. Detailed timetables are set out in Appendix 1 to this report. Scores for both Standard and Alternative Tenders appear as Appendix 2 to the report.

Option 1 (Ratho - Ratho Station - Ingliston P&R – Gyle Centre)

30-minute frequency Monday to Saturday, 60-minute frequency on Sundays.

Option 2 (Ratho - Ratho Station - Ingliston P&R – Gyle Centre/Maybury - Drumbrae Rdbt – Haymarket - Waterloo Place)

30-minute frequency every day between Ratho and the Gyle Centre, with some peak-time journeys extending to the city centre, Monday to Saturday. 60-minute frequency on Sundays, Ratho - Gyle Centre only.

Option 3 (Ratho - Ratho Station - Maybury-Drumbrae Rdbt – Haymarket - Waterloo Place)

60-minute frequency every day between Ratho and the city centre.

Option 4 (Ratho - Ratho Station - Ingliston P&R – Gyle Centre - Edinburgh Park Station)

30-minute frequency Monday to Saturday between Ratho and Edinburgh Park Station via Gyle, 60-minute frequency on Sunday.

Alternative Tenders

- 2.6 Lothian Buses plc submitted Alternative Tenders for Options 1, 2 and 3.

Option 1 Alternative Tender

The route and 30-minute frequencies of the standard Option 1 are preserved, with minor modifications to the timing of evening journeys to permit operation by one vehicle, so reducing costs. Minor alterations to peak timings also feature to reflect expected passenger demand. This was offered at a weekly cost of £5,100 (£265,200 *per annum*).

Option 2 Alternative Tender

The route and 30-minute frequencies of the standard Option 2 are preserved, with modifications to the timetable to address inefficiencies and reduce the number of vehicles required. The number of return peak time journeys between Ratho and Waterloo Place is also reduced from five to three. This was offered at a weekly cost of £9,224 (£479,648 *per annum*).

Option 3 Alternative Tender

The 60-minute frequency of the standard Option 3 is preserved, and the route extended during the off-peak period, seven days per week to serve the Ratho Climbing Centre, via Wilkieston Road and Cliftonhall Road. This was offered at a weekly cost of £6,240 (£324,480 *per annum*).

First Scotland East Ltd submitted one Alternative Tender for Option 4. However, this was ruled an incompetent tender as it deviated fundamentally from the standard Option 4 specification in reducing the service frequency from 30-minutes to 60-minutes.

- 2.7 No Alternative Tenders were submitted by E&M Horsburgh.
- 2.8 The winning tender with an overall score of 85, was Lothian Buses Option 1 Alternative Tender, at a weekly cost of £5,100 (£265,200 *per annum*).

Public Transport Provision for Dumbiedykes

- 2.9 The initial tendering exercise for a potential Dumbiedykes public transport link, the results of which were reported to the Committee in January, showed that a stand-alone bus service for this purpose was unaffordable.
- 2.10 That being the case, officials are engaging in negotiations with operators participating in the Framework Agreement for the Supply of Local Bus services, aimed at extending or altering an existing or proposed commercial bus service to provide the desired public transport link for Dumbiedykes. It is hoped that these discussions will lead to a positive and affordable solution.

3. Recommendations

- 3.1 It is recommended that the Committee:
 - 3.1.1 notes the intention to accept Lothian Buses Option 1 Alternative Tender at a cost of £5,100 per week (£265,200 *per annum*) to take effect from the commencement of Tram operations for a period of up to four years; and
 - 3.1.2 notes that alternative solutions for a public transport link for Dumbiedykes are still being explored by officials, and that should these negotiations be successful any solution will, after consultation with the Convener, be progressed by the Director of Services for Communities using delegated powers conferred by the Council's Contract Standing Orders.

Mark Turley

Director of Services for Communities

Links

Coalition pledges	<p>P19 – Keep Lothian Buses in public hands and encourage the improvement of routes and times.</p> <p>P47 – Set up city-wide Transport Forum of experts and citizens to consider our modern transport needs.</p>
Council outcomes	<p>CO9 – Edinburgh residents are able to access job opportunities.</p> <p>CO10 – Improved health and reduced inequality.</p> <p>CO22 - Moving efficiently – Edinburgh has a transport system that improves connectivity and is green, healthy and accessible.</p>
Single Outcome Agreement	<p>SO1 – Edinburgh’s economy delivers increased investment, jobs and opportunities.</p> <p>SO2 – Edinburgh’s citizens experience improved health and wellbeing with reduced inequalities in health.</p>
Appendices	<p>Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service</p> <p>Appendix 2: Tenders Received, Scores and Financial Implications.</p>

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 1

Route

RATHO (HALLROFT PK), Wilkieston Rd, Main St, Baird Rd, Harvest Rd, Harvest Dr, Station Rd, A8, Newbridge Rdbt, A8, Eastfield Rd, Ingliston P&R, Eastfield Rd, A8, Glasgow Rd, South Gyle Broadway, **GYLE CENTRE**.

Return route is the reverse of the above except omitting Newbridge Rdbt.

Stopping Pattern

- All stops.

Monday to Friday

Hallcroft Pk	0556	0626	0656	0726	0756	0826	0856	0926	0956	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326
Ratho Stn	0604	0634	0704	0734	0804	0834	0904	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334
Ingliston P&R	0615	0645	0715	0745	0815	0845	0915	0945	1015	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345
Gyle Centre	0623	0653	0723	0753	0823	0853	0923	0953	1023	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353

Hallcroft Pk	1356	1426	1456	1526	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226	2326
Ratho Stn	1404	1434	1504	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234	2334
Ingliston P&R	1415	1445	1515	1545	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345
Gyle Centre	1423	1453	1523	1553	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253	2353

Gyle Centre	0659	0729	0759	0829	0759	0829	0859	0929	0959	1029	1059	1129	1159	1229	1259	1329
Ingliston P&R	0706	0736	0806	0836	0906	0836	0906	0936	1006	1036	1106	1136	1206	1236	1306	1336
Ratho Stn	0711	0741	0811	0841	0911	0841	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341
Hallcroft Pk	0720	0750	0820	0850	0920	0850	0920	0950	1020	1050	1120	1150	1220	1250	1320	1350

Gyle Centre	1359	1429	1459	1529	1559	1629	1659	1729	1759	1829	1859	1929	2029	2129	2229	2329
Ingliston P&R	1406	1436	1506	1536	1606	1636	1706	1736	1806	1836	1906	1936	2036	2136	2236	2336
Ratho Stn	1411	1441	1511	1541	1611	1641	1711	1741	1811	1841	1911	1941	2041	2141	2241	2341
Hallcroft Pk	1420	1450	1520	1550	1620	1650	1720	1750	1820	1850	1920	1950	2053	2150	2252	2352

Saturday

Hallcroft Pk	0626	0726	0756	0826	0856	0926	0956	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326	1356
Ratho Stn	0634	0734	0804	0834	0904	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404
Ingliston P&R	0645	0745	0815	0845	0915	0945	1015	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345	1415
Gyle Centre	0653	0753	0823	0853	0923	0953	1023	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353	1423

Hallcroft Pk	1426	1456	1526	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226	2326
Ratho Stn	1434	1504	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234	2334
Ingliston P&R	1445	1515	1545	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345
Gyle Centre	1453	1523	1553	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253	2353

Gyle Centre	0659	0759	0829	0759	0829	0859	0929	0959	1029	1059	1129	1159	1229	1259	1329	1359
Ingliston P&R	0706	0806	0836	0906	0836	0906	0936	1006	1036	1106	1136	1206	1236	1306	1336	1406
Ratho Stn	0711	0811	0841	0911	0841	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341	1411
Hallcroft Pk	0720	0820	0850	0920	0850	0920	0950	1020	1050	1120	1150	1220	1250	1320	1350	1420

Gyle Centre	1429	1459	1529	1559	1629	1659	1729	1759	1829	1859	1929	2029	2129	2229	2329
Ingliston P&R	1436	1506	1536	1606	1636	1706	1736	1806	1836	1906	1936	2036	2136	2236	2336
Ratho Stn	1441	1511	1541	1611	1641	1711	1741	1811	1841	1911	1941	2041	2141	2241	2341
Hallcroft Pk	1450	1520	1550	1620	1650	1720	1750	1820	1850	1920	1950	2053	2150	2252	2352

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 1 (Contd.)

Sunday

Hallcroft Pk	0826	0926	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326	1356	1426	1456	1526
Ratho Stn	0834	0934	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404	1434	1504	1534
Ingliston P&R	0845	0945	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345	1415	1445	1515	1545
Gyle Centre	0853	0953	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353	1423	1453	1523	1553

Hallcroft Pk	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226	2326
Ratho Stn	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234	2334
Ingliston P&E	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345
Gyle Centre	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253	2353

Gyle Centre	0759	0859	0929	0959	1029	1059	1129	1159	1229	1259	1329	1359	1429	1459
Ingliston P&R	0806	0906	0936	1006	1036	1106	1136	1206	1236	1306	1336	1406	1436	1506
Ratho Stn	0811	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341	1411	1441	1511
Hallcroft Pk	0820	0920	0950	1020	1050	1120	1150	1220	1250	1320	1350	1420	1450	1520

Gyle Centre	1529	1559	1629	1659	1729	1759	1829	1859	1929	2029	2129	2229	2329
Ingliston P&R	1536	1606	1636	1706	1736	1806	1836	1906	1936	2036	2136	2236	2336
Ratho Stn	1541	1611	1641	1711	1741	1811	1841	1911	1941	2041	2141	2241	2341
Hallcroft Pk	1550	1620	1650	1720	1750	1820	1850	1920	1950	2053	2150	2252	2352

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 2

Weekday Peak Time Route

RATHO (HALLROFT PK), Wilkieston Rd, Main St, Baird Rd, Harvest Rd, Harvest Dr, Station Rd, A8, Newbridge Rdbt, A8, Eastfield Rd, Ingliston P&R, Eastfield Rd, A8, Glasgow Rd, St John's Rd, Corstorphine Rd, Roseburn Terrace, West Coates, Haymarket Terr, West Maitland St, Shandwick Pl, Princes St, **WATERLOO PLACE**.

Return route is the reverse of the above except omitting Newbridge Rdbt

Off-Peak Route

RATHO (HALLROFT PK), Wilkieston Rd, Main St, Baird Rd, Harvest Rd, Harvest Dr, Station Rd, A8, Newbridge Rdbt, A8, Eastfield Rd, Ingliston P&R, Eastfield Rd, A8, Glasgow Rd, South Gyle Broadway, **GYLE CENTRE**.

Return route is the reverse of the above except omitting Newbridge Rdbt

Stopping Pattern

- **Weekday Peak time journeys operate as limited stop between Maybury and Shandwick Place.**
- **Weekday Off-Peak and weekend journeys use all stops.**

Monday to Friday

Hallcroft Pk	0544	0644	0707	0742	0852	0926	0956	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326	1356
Ratho Stn	0551	0652	0715	0750	0900	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404
Ingliston P&R	0558	0701	0725	0803	0913	0945	1015	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345	1415
Gyle Centre	-	-	-	-	-	0953	1023	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353	1423
Maybury	0602	0706	0730	0810	0918	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Drumbrae Rdbt	0605	0709	0733	0814	0921	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Haymarket	0614	0719	0744	0826	0932	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Waterloo Pl	0624	0731	0758	0840	0945	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Hallcroft Pk	1426	1456	1526	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226	2326
Ratho Stn	1434	1504	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234	2334
Ingliston P&R	1445	1515	1545	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345
Gyle Centre	1453	1523	1553	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253	2353

Gyle Centre	0659	0729	0759	0829	0759	0829	0859	0929	0959	1029	1059	1129	1159	1229	1259	1329
Ingliston P&R	0706	0736	0806	0836	0906	0836	0906	0936	1006	1036	1106	1136	1206	1236	1306	1336
Ratho Stn	0711	0741	0811	0841	0911	0841	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341
Hallcroft Pk	0720	0750	0820	0850	0920	0850	0920	0950	1020	1050	1120	1150	1220	1250	1320	1350

Waterloo Pl	-	-	-	-	-	1600	1642	1718	1745	1815	-	-	-	-	-
Haymarket	-	-	-	-	-	1650	1659	1735	1802	1829	-	-	-	-	-
Drumbrae Rdbt	-	-	-	-	-	1627	1711	1747	1814	1838	-	-	-	-	-
Maybury	-	-	-	-	-	1630	1714	1750	1817	1841	-	-	-	-	-
Gyle Centre	1359	1429	1459	1529	1559	-	-	-	-	-	1929	2029	2129	2229	2329
Ingliston P&R	1406	1436	1506	1536	1606	1636	1720	1756	1822	1846	1936	2036	2136	2236	2336
Ratho Stn	1411	1441	1511	1541	1611	1642	1726	1802	1827	1851	1941	2041	2141	2241	2341
Hallcroft Pk	1420	1450	1520	1550	1620	1651	1735	1811	1836	1900	1950	2053	2150	2252	2352

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 2 (Contd).

Saturday

Hallcroft Pk	0644	0742	0852	0926	0956	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326	1356
Ratho Stn	0652	0750	0900	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404
Ingliston P&R	0701	0803	0913	0945	1015	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345	1415
Gyle Centre	-	-	-	0953	1023	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353	1423
Maybury	0706	0810	0918	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Drumbrae Rdbt	0709	0814	0921	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Haymarket	0719	0826	0932	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Waterloo Pl	0731	0840	0945	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-

Hallcroft Pk	1426	1456	1526	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226	2326
Ratho Stn	1434	1504	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234	2334
Ingliston P&E	1445	1515	1545	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345
Gyle Centre	1453	1523	1553	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253	2353

Gyle Centre	0659	0729	0759	0829	0759	0829	0859	0929	0959	1029	1059	1129	1159	1229	1259	1329
Ingliston P&R	0706	0736	0806	0836	0906	0836	0906	0936	1006	1036	1106	1136	1206	1236	1306	1336
Ratho Stn	0711	0741	0811	0841	0911	0841	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341
Hallcroft Pk	0720	0750	0820	0850	0920	0850	0920	0950	1020	1050	1120	1150	1220	1250	1320	1350

Waterloo Pl	-	-	-	-	-	1600	1642	1718	1745	1815	-	-	-	-	-
Haymarket	-	-	-	-	-	1650	1659	1735	1802	1829	-	-	-	-	-
Drumbrae Rdbt	-	-	-	-	-	1627	1711	1747	1814	1838	-	-	-	-	-
Maybury	-	-	-	-	-	1630	1714	1750	1817	1841	-	-	-	-	-
Gyle Centre	1359	1429	1459	1529	1559	-	-	-	-	-	1929	2029	2129	2229	2329
Ingliston P&R	1406	1436	1506	1536	1606	1636	1720	1756	1822	1846	1936	2036	2136	2236	2336
Ratho Stn	1411	1441	1511	1541	1611	1642	1726	1802	1827	1851	1941	2041	2141	2241	2341
Hallcroft Pk	1420	1450	1520	1550	1620	1651	1735	1811	1836	1900	1950	2050	2150	2250	2350

Sunday

Hallcroft Pk	0826	0926	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326	1356	1426	1456
Ratho Stn	0834	0934	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404	1434	1504
Ingliston P&R	0845	0945	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345	1415	1445	1515
Gyle Centre	0853	0953	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353	1423	1453	1523

Hallcroft Pk	1526	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226	2326
Ratho Stn	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234	2334
Ingliston P&E	1545	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345
Gyle Centre	1553	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253	2353

Gyle Centre	0759	0859	0929	0959	1029	1059	1129	1159	1229	1259	1329	1359	1429
Ingliston P&R	0806	0906	0936	1006	1036	1106	1136	1206	1236	1306	1336	1406	1436
Ratho Stn	0811	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341	1411	1441
Hallcroft Pk	0820	0920	0950	1020	1050	1120	1150	1220	1250	1320	1350	1420	1450

Gyle Centre	1459	1529	1559	1629	1659	1729	1759	1829	1859	1929	2029	2129	2229	2329
Ingliston P&R	1506	1536	1606	1636	1706	1736	1806	1836	1906	1936	2036	2136	2236	2336
Ratho Stn	1511	1541	1611	1641	1711	1741	1811	1841	1911	1941	2041	2141	2241	2341
Hallcroft Pk	1520	1550	1620	1650	1720	1750	1820	1850	1920	1950	2050	2150	2202	2350

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 3

Route

RATHO (HALLROFT PK), Wilkieston Rd, Main St, Baird Rd, Harvest Rd, Harvest Dr, Station Rd, A8, Newbridge Rdbt, A8, Eastfield Rd, Ingliston P&R, Eastfield Rd, A8, Glasgow Rd, St John's Rd, Corstorphine Rd, Roseburn Terrace, West Coates, Haymarket Terr, West Maitland St, Shandwick Pl, Princes St, **WATERLOO PLACE**

Return route is the reverse of the above except omitting Newbridge Rdbt

Stopping Pattern

- **Weekday Peak time journeys operate as limited stop between Maybury and Shandwick Place.**
- **Weekday Off-Peak and weekend journeys use all stops.**

Monday to Friday

Hallcroft Pk	0556	0656	0756	0856	0956	1056	1156	1256	1356	1456
Ratho Stn	0608	0708	0808	0908	1008	1108	1208	1308	1408	1508
Maybury	0618	0718	0818	0918	1018	1118	1218	1318	1418	1518
Drumbrae Rdbt	0621	0721	0821	0921	1021	1121	1221	1321	1421	1521
Haymarket	0633	0733	0833	0933	1033	1133	1233	1333	1433	1533
Waterloo Pl	0645	0745	0845	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1545

Hallcroft Pk	1556	1656	1756	1856	1956	2056	2156	2256	2356
Ratho Stn	1608	1708	1808	1908	2008	2108	2208	2308	0008
Maybury	1618	1718	1818	1918	2018	2118	2218	2318	0018
Drumbrae Rdbt	1621	1721	1821	1921	2021	2121	2221	2321	0021
Haymarket	1633	1733	1833	1933	2033	2133	2233	2333	0033
Waterloo Pl	1645	1745	1845	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345	0045

Waterloo Pl	0700	0800	0900	1000	1100	1200	1300	1400	1500	1600
Haymarket	0708	0808	0908	1008	1108	1208	1308	1408	1508	1608
Drumbrae Rdbt	0715	0815	0915	1015	1115	1215	1315	1415	1515	1615
Maybury	0718	0818	0918	1018	1118	1218	1318	1418	1518	1618
Ratho Stn	0728	0828	0928	1028	1128	1228	1328	1428	1528	1628
Hallcroft Pk	0735	0835	0935	1035	1135	1235	1335	1435	1535	1635

Waterloo Pl	1630	1700	1730	1800	1900	2000	2100	2200	2300
Haymarket	1638	1708	1738	1808	1908	2008	2108	2208	2308
Drumbrae Rdbt	1645	1715	1745	1815	1915	2015	2115	2215	2315
Maybury	1658	1718	1758	1818	1918	2018	2118	2218	2318
Ratho Stn	1708	1728	1808	1828	1928	2028	2128	2228	2328
Hallcroft Pk	1715	1735	1815	1835	1935	2035	2135	2235	2335

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 3 (Contd.)

Saturday

Hallcroft Pk	0656	0756	0856	0956	1056	1156	1256	1356	1456
Ratho Stn	0708	0808	0908	1008	1108	1208	1308	1408	1508
Maybury	0718	0818	0918	1018	1118	1218	1318	1418	1518
Drumbrae Rdbt	0721	0821	0921	1021	1121	1221	1321	1421	1521
Haymarket	0733	0833	0933	1033	1133	1233	1333	1433	1533
Waterloo Pl	0745	0845	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1545

Hallcroft Pk	1556	1656	1756	1856	1956	2056	2156	2256	2356
Ratho Stn	1608	1708	1808	1908	2008	2108	2208	2308	0008
Maybury	1618	1718	1818	1918	2018	2118	2218	2318	0018
Drumbrae Rdbt	1621	1721	1821	1921	2021	2121	2221	2321	0021
Haymarket	1633	1733	1833	1933	2033	2133	2233	2333	0033
Waterloo Pl	1645	1745	1845	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345	0045

Waterloo Pl	0800	0900	1000	1100	1200	1300	1400	1500
Haymarket	0808	0908	1008	1108	1208	1308	1408	1508
Drumbrae Rdbt	0815	0915	1015	1115	1215	1315	1415	1515
Maybury	0818	0918	1018	1118	1218	1318	1418	1518
Ratho Stn	0828	0928	1028	1128	1228	1328	1428	1528
Hallcroft Pk	0835	0935	1035	1135	1235	1335	1435	1535

Waterloo Pl	1600	1700	1800	1900	2000	2100	2200	2300
Haymarket	1608	1708	1808	1908	2008	2108	2208	2308
Drumbrae Rdbt	1615	1715	1815	1915	2015	2115	2215	2315
Maybury	1618	1718	1818	1918	2018	2118	2218	2318
Ratho Stn	1628	1728	1828	1928	2028	2128	2228	2328
Hallcroft Pk	1635	1735	1835	1935	2035	2135	2235	2335

Sunday

Hallcroft Pk	0856	0956	1056	1156	1256	1356	1456	1556	1656	1756	1856	1956	2056	2156	2256	2356
Ratho Stn	0908	1008	1108	1208	1308	1408	1508	1608	1708	1808	1908	2008	2108	2208	2308	0008
Maybury	0918	1018	1118	1218	1318	1418	1518	1618	1718	1818	1918	2018	2118	2218	2318	0018
Drumbrae Rdbt	0921	1021	1121	1221	1321	1421	1521	1621	1721	1821	1921	2021	2121	2221	2321	0021
Haymarket	0933	1033	1133	1233	1333	1433	1533	1633	1733	1833	1933	2033	2133	2233	2333	0033
Waterloo Pl	0945	1045	1145	1245	1345	1445	1545	1645	1745	1845	1945	2045	2145	2245	2345	0045

Waterloo Pl	1000	1100	1200	1300	1400	1500	1600	1700	1800	1900	2000	2100	2200	2300
Haymarket	1008	1108	1208	1308	1408	1508	1608	1708	1808	1908	2008	2108	2208	2308
Drumbrae Rdbt	1015	1115	1215	1315	1415	1515	1615	1715	1815	1915	2015	2115	2215	2315
Maybury	1018	1118	1218	1318	1418	1518	1618	1718	1818	1918	2018	2118	2218	2318
Ratho Stn	1028	1128	1228	1328	1428	1528	1628	1728	1828	1928	2028	2128	2228	2328
Hallcroft Pk	1035	1135	1235	1335	1435	1535	1635	1735	1835	1935	2035	2135	2235	2335

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 4

Route

RATHO (HALLROFT PK), Wilkieston Rd, Main St, Baird Rd, Harvest Rd, Harvest Dr, Station Rd, A8, Newbridge Rdbt, A8, Eastfield Rd, Ingliston P&R, Eastfield Rd, A8, Glasgow Rd, South Gyle Broadway, Gyle Avenue, Gyle Centre, Gyle Avenue, Edinburgh Park, Lochside Crescent, Lochside Place, Lochside Court, **EDINBURGH PARK STATION**.

Return route is the reverse of the above except omitting Newbridge Rdbt.

Stopping Pattern

- All stops.

Monday to Friday

Hallcroft Pk	0556	0626	0656	0726	0756	0826	0856	0926	0956	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326
Ratho Stn	0604	0634	0704	0734	0804	0834	0904	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334
Ingliston P&R	0615	0645	0715	0745	0815	0845	0915	0945	1015	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345
Gyle Centre	0623	0653	0723	0753	0823	0853	0923	0953	1023	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353
Edinb Pk Stn	0627	0657	0727	0757	0827	0857	0927	0957	1027	1057	1127	1157	1227	1257	1327	1357

Hallcroft Pk	1356	1426	1456	1526	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226
Ratho Stn	1404	1434	1504	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234
Ingliston P&R	1415	1445	1515	1545	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245
Gyle Centre	1423	1453	1523	1553	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253
Edinb Pk Stn	1427	1457	1527	1557	1627	1657	1727	1757	1827	1857	1927	1957	2027	2157	2257

Edinb Pk Stn	0630	0700	0730	0800	0830	0900	0930	1000	1030	1100	1130	1200	1230	1300	1330	1400
Gyle Centre	0634	0704	0734	0804	0834	0904	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404
Ingliston P&R	0641	0711	0741	0811	0841	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341	1411
Ratho Stn	0646	0716	0746	0816	0846	0916	0946	1016	1046	1116	1146	1216	1246	1316	1346	1416
Hallcroft Pk	0654	0724	0754	0824	0854	0924	0954	1024	1054	1124	1154	1224	1254	1324	1354	1424

Edinb Pk Stn	1430	1500	1530	1600	1630	1700	1730	1800	1830	1900	1930	2000	2100	2200	2300
Gyle Centre	1434	1504	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2004	2104	2204	2304
Ingliston P&R	1441	1511	1541	1611	1641	1711	1741	1811	1841	1911	1941	2011	2111	2211	2311
Ratho Stn	1446	1516	1546	1616	1646	1716	1746	1816	1846	1916	1946	2016	2116	2216	2316
Hallcroft Pk	1454	1524	1554	1624	1654	1724	1754	1824	1854	1924	1954	2024	2124	2224	2324

Appendix 1: Standard Options: Ratho Bus Service Option 4 (Contd.)

Saturday

Hallcroft Pk	0756	0826	0856	0926	0956	1026	1056	1126	1156	1226	1256	1326	1356	1426
Ratho Stn	0804	0834	0904	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404	1434
Ingliston P&R	0815	0845	0915	0945	1015	1045	1115	1145	1215	1245	1315	1345	1415	1445
Gyle Centre	0823	0853	0923	0953	1023	1053	1123	1153	1223	1253	1323	1353	1423	1453
Edinb Pk Stn	0827	0857	0927	0957	1027	1057	1127	1157	1227	1257	1327	1357	1427	1457

Hallcroft Pk	1456	1526	1556	1626	1656	1726	1756	1826	1856	1926	2026	2126	2226
Ratho Stn	1504	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2034	2134	2234
Ingliston P&E	1515	1545	1615	1645	1715	1745	1815	1845	1915	1945	2045	2145	2245
Gyle Centre	1523	1553	1623	1653	1723	1753	1823	1853	1923	1953	2053	2153	2253
Edinb Pk Stn	1527	1557	1627	1657	1727	1757	1827	1857	1927	1957	2027	2157	2257

Edinb Pk Stn	0830	0900	0930	1000	1030	1100	1130	1200	1230	1300	1330	1400	1430	1500
Gyle Centre	0834	0904	0934	1004	1034	1104	1134	1204	1234	1304	1334	1404	1434	1504
Ingliston P&R	0841	0911	0941	1011	1041	1111	1141	1211	1241	1311	1341	1411	1441	1511
Ratho Stn	0846	0916	0946	1016	1046	1116	1146	1216	1246	1316	1346	1416	1446	1516
Hallcroft Pk	0854	0924	0954	1024	1054	1124	1154	1224	1254	1324	1354	1424	1454	1524

Edinb Pk Stn	1530	1600	1630	1700	1730	1800	1830	1900	1930	2000	2100	2200	2300
Gyle Centre	1534	1604	1634	1704	1734	1804	1834	1904	1934	2004	2104	2204	2304
Ingliston P&R	1541	1611	1641	1711	1741	1811	1841	1911	1941	2011	2111	2211	2311
Ratho Stn	1546	1616	1646	1716	1746	1816	1846	1916	1946	2016	2116	2216	2316
Hallcroft Pk	1554	1624	1654	1724	1754	1824	1854	1924	1954	2024	2124	2224	2324

Sunday

Hallcroft Pk	0856	0956	1056	1156	1256	1356	1456	1556	1656	1756	1856	1956	2056	2156	2256
Ratho Stn	0904	1004	1104	1204	1304	1404	1504	1604	1704	1804	1904	2004	2104	2204	2304
Ingliston P&R	0915	1015	1115	1215	1315	1415	1515	1615	1715	1815	1915	2015	2115	2215	2315
Gyle Centre	0923	1023	1123	1223	1323	1423	1523	1623	1723	1823	1923	2023	2123	2223	2323
Edinb Pk Stn	0927	1027	1127	1227	1327	1427	1527	1627	1727	1827	1927	2027	2127	2227	2327

Edinb Pk Stn	0930	1030	1130	1230	1330	1430	1530	1630	1730	1830	1930	2030	2130	2230	2330
Gyle Centre	0934	1034	1134	1234	1334	1434	1534	1634	1734	1834	1934	2034	2134	2234	2334
Ingliston P&R	0941	1041	1141	1241	1341	1441	1541	1641	1741	1841	1941	2041	2141	2241	2341
Ratho Stn	0946	1046	1146	1246	1346	1446	1546	1646	1746	1846	1946	2046	2146	2246	2346
Hallcroft Pk	0954	1054	1154	1254	1354	1454	1554	1654	1754	1854	1954	2054	2154	2254	2354

Appendix 2: Tenders Received, Scores and Financial Implications

Tenderer	Tender	Cost/Quality Scores	Weekly Cost (£)	Annual Cost (£)	Cost over 4 Years (£)	% Multiplier Over Current Cost
E&M Horsburgh	Option 1	48.5	7,815	406,380	1,625,520	207%
E&M Horsburgh	Option 2	40.0	10,040	522,080	2,088,320	268%
E&M Horsburgh	Option 3	43.2	9,055	470,860	1,883,440	242%
E&M Horsburgh	Option 4	51.6	7,215	375,180	1,500,720	192%
First Scotland East Ltd	Option 1	62.5	8,170	424,840	1,699,360	218%
First Scotland East Ltd	Option 4	69.9	6,810	354,120	1,416,480	182%
Lothian Buses plc	Option 1	63.2	8,274	430,248	1,720,992	221%
Lothian Buses plc	Option 2	51.1	12,418	645,736	2,582,944	331%
Lothian Buses plc	Option 3	63.5	8,200	426,400	1,705,600	219%
Lothian Buses plc	Option 4	67.7	7,465	388,180	1,552,720	199%
Lothian Buses plc	Option 1 Alternative	85	5,100	265,200	1,060,800	136%
Lothian Buses plc	Option 2 Alternative	57.2	9,224	479,648	1,918,592	246%
Lothian Buses plc	Option 3 Alternative	76.5	6,240	324,480	1,297,920	166%

Note: The aim of the mini competition evaluation is to select the Tender which represents the best overall value for money. Scoring for Standard Options is based solely on price. Scoring for Alternative Tenders is based on 50% price and 50% on the answers to additional quality-orientated questions.